Overriding Normative-Work Handout

Kory Matteoli, `bjmatteoli@ucdavis.edu`

Concepts

Logical Monism There is only one correct logic.

Logical Pluralism There is more than one correct logic.

Strict Strongness L_1 is strictly stronger than L_2 iff L_1 validates all but not only what L_2 validates.

Work All logics do normative work.

Only One Works Only one logic does normative work.

Ecumenical Normative-Work A logic does normative work iff it makes an ecumenical normative-difference.

Ecumenical Normative-Difference A difference to what an agent is obligated, entitled, or has reason to do.

Strongest Only the strongest logic makes an ecumenical normative-difference.

Overriding Normative-Work A logic does normative-work iff it makes an overriding normative-difference.

Overriding Normative-Difference A difference to what an agent should actually do.

Override (Strongest*) Only the strongest logic makes an overriding normative-difference.

Collapse Arguments

Blake-Turner's collapse argument:

1. All logics do normative work.

2. A logic does normative work iff it makes an ecumenical normative-difference.

3. Only the strongest logic makes an ecumenical normative-difference.

4. Therefore, only one logic does normative work.

My collapse argument:

1. All logics do normative work.

2. A logic does normative-work iff it makes an overriding normative-difference.

3. Only the strongest logic makes an overriding normative-difference.

4. Therefore, only one logic does normative work.

Analogies

Agree on Validity I promise to go to your party. Since I have promised, all else equal, I'm obligated to go. Beyoncé is also coming to your party. This gives me a reason to go to your party that I wouldn't otherwise have, but it doesn't affect my obligation.

Disagree on Validity I promise to go to your party. Since I have promised, all else equal, I'm obligated to go. I win a ticket to a Beyoncé concert that's at the same time as your party, but elsewhere. This gives me a reason to not go to your party, but it's not enough to override my obligation.

Undefeated Obligations 1 I promise to go to your party, but later win a concert ticket like before. For each person that attends the concert, a charity will receive a large sum of money which they'll use to do a lot of good. This, plausibly, gives me an overriding reason to not go to your party, but to the concert instead.

Undefeated Obligations 2 I promise not to go to your party, but I later learn that if I break my promise, Beyoncé will make a charitable donation like before. This, plausibly, gives me an overriding reason to go to your party instead of staying at home.

Forced Agreement I'm working for my boss, Tony, who tells me what I should or shouldn't do. However, Tony has his own boss: Jeannie. Jeannie tells Tony what he should or shouldn't do, which he tells me. If Jeannie wants us to not do something, Tony agrees. If Jeannie wants us to do something, Tony tells me—even if he disagrees—and we do what Jeannie wants. We only ever actually do what Jeannie says.